High-Impact Practices to Promote Student Learning and Success: Considerations for Effectiveness, Quality and Equity

Jillian Kinzie
Indiana University Center for Postsecondary Research
21st Century: Turning Point for Higher Education

• Getting students in the front door is only the first step—we also have to help them reach the graduation stage.

• Need students to have high quality educational experiences—and be better prepared for 21st century workforce.
Stuff that has been on the margins of the curricular experience – service learning, undergraduate research, internships – could be built into a new degree.

The traditional college curriculum waits too long to put students in over their heads.

Randy Bass, vice provost of undergraduate education, Georgetown University

Chronicle of HE 5/22/16
High-Impact Practices

Educational experiences that make a significant difference to student persistence, learning outcomes, and student success.

HIPS = Pedagogies and Practices that Challenge and Stretch Students
High Impact Activities

★ First-Year Seminars and Experiences
★ Common Intellectual Experiences
★ Learning Communities
★ Writing-Intensive Courses
★ Collaborative Assignments and Projects
★ Undergraduate Research
★ Diversity/Global Learning
★ Service Learning, Community-Based Learning
★ Internships
★ Capstone Courses/Projects
★ E-portfolios
noun, *Slang*. 1. a person who implements effective educational practices in a stylish, progressive way; someone who is *hip*. 
What is a HIP to Students?

I have teachers that take us out of the building. I don't know what it's called. It's called--it's called something here. They take you out of the building, and you go learn about like the vegetable gardens that they have growing here, among the Hmong society...So there's a lot of professors here that teach differently.” Student, Wisconsin

Okay, can we be more explicit about learning outcomes??
What’s all the Hype about HIPs?
HIPs put Student Learning at the Center

- High Engagement (Peers, Mentors, Unscripted Questions)
- High Effort (by Students)
- High Reward (for Learning)
Employers assess the potential value of high-impact educational practices

84% saying each would help a lot/fair amount to prepare college students for success

Students complete a significant project before graduation that demonstrates their depth of knowledge in their major AND their acquisition of analytical, problem-solving, and communication skills (62% help a lot)

81% Students complete an internship or community-based field project to connect classroom learning with real-world experiences (66%)

81% Students develop research skills appropriate to their field and develop evidence-based analyses (57%)

73% Students work through ethical issues and debates to form their own judgments (48%)
Faculty Agree HIPs are Important

• How important is it to faculty that undergraduates do HIPs (“very important + important”):
  – Culminating Exp/Capstone 88%
  – Internships 88%
  – Community Service 64%
  – Research with faculty 57%
  – Learning community 49%
  – Study Abroad 40%

» FSSE 2016 Upper Division Faculty results
If faculty view activity as important, students are more likely to do it.
HIPs on NSSE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>High-Impact Practices</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learning community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service-learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research with faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internship or field experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study abroad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culminating senior experience</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NSSE: National Survey of Student Engagement
Some HIPs are Increasing...

HIP Participation NSSE 2007 vs. 2016

- Learning Community: 25% (2007), 25% (2016)
- Undergrad Research: 19% (2007), 25% (2016)
- Study Abroad: 14% (2007), 14% (2016)
- Internships: 53% (2007), 51% (2016)
- Service-Learning*: 61% (2007), 46% (2016)
- Capstone: 32% (2007), 46% (2016)

* S-L question changed in 2013, but is roughly approximate
HIPs Positively Related to Deep, Integrated Learning, and Educational Gains

### Relationships between Selected High-Impact Activities, Deep Learning, and Self-Reported Gains

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Deep Learning</th>
<th>Gains: General</th>
<th>Gains: Personal</th>
<th>Gains: Practical</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>First-Year</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning Communities</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Learning</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>+++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Senior</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study Abroad</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student–Faculty Research</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internships</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Learning</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>+++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Culminating Experience</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*+ p < 0.001, ++ p < 0.001 & Unstd B > 0.10, +++ p < 0.001 & Unstd B > 0.30*
HIP Outcomes

HIPs positively associated with:
• Persistence & GPA
• “Deep approaches to learning”
• Higher rates of student-faculty interaction
• Increases in critical thinking, writing skills,
• Greater appreciation for diversity
• Higher student engagement overall

Bronwell & Swaner, 2010; Finley & McNair, 2013; Kuh, 2008; NSSE, 2007; 2015;
Are High-Impact Practices Equally Effective Across all Outcomes?

- Not uniformly effective
- Most sizable effect on Deep Learning
- Service Learning had greatest impact on all 4 outcomes

Figure 1. Size of Effect of HIPs on All Measured Outcomes (Averages across California, Oregon, and Wisconsin State Systems Data (Finley, 2011 Peer Review))
The IUPUI RISE initiative engages students more deeply in their learning and contributes to their intellectual and professional development in unique ways.
Assessing High-Impact Practices and RISE Experiences: Impact on 1st year Retention

RISE Course Tags and One-Year Retention

One-Year Retention for all Students in a Course Tagged as RISE

- RISE Experiential Learning: 94%
- RISE International/Study Abroad: 83%
- RISE Research: 92%
- RISE Research and Experiential Learning: 90%
- RISE Research and Service Learning: 81%
- RISE Service Learning: 82%
- Grand Total: 90%

Students are counted once for every RISE course enrolled in. They may be enrolled in more than one course tagged as RISE. This is duplicated headcount.

(Hansen, Graunke, Springer, 2016)
HIPs: What's all the Hype?

• Positively associated with learning outcomes & student success
• Respected, researched pedagogies
• Beneficial to all students
• Valued by employers
• Important to faculty
• Enjoyable for students!
HIPs help ensure that students are getting the most out of college.
What Makes HIP Effective?

“8 HIP Hallmarks” elements that—when employed—make the impact:

✓ High expectations for performance
✓ Demand time & effort
✓ Substantive interaction w/ faculty & peers
✓ They help students engage across differences
✓ They provide students with rich feedback
✓ Structured opportunities to reflect & integrate (on who students are becoming)
✓ Opportunity to apply & test learning in new situations
✓ Public demonstration of competence

(excerpts from O’Neill, Peer Review, 2010)
HIP Outcomes

HIPs positively associated with:

• Persistence & GPA
• “Deep approaches to learning”
• Higher rates of student-faculty interaction
• Increases in critical thinking, writing skills,
• Greater appreciation for diversity
• Higher student engagement overall
• Impact is larger for underserved students

Bronwell & Swaner, 2010; Finley & McNair, 2013; Kuh, 2008;
NSSE, 2007; 2015;
Impact of HIPs is Greatest for Historically Underserved Students
HIP Effectiveness Research and Impact on Underserved Students Led to Prescription:

All Students Do 2...

one early, one later
Lesson 1: High Impact Practices

• All associated with desirable learning and personal development outcomes.
PAUSE for reflection: What HIPs are you interested in? for which students? why?
How Many HIPs do Students Need?

Do Multiple HIPs Make a Difference?
Effect of Multiple HIPs

• Huber (2010) CSUN senior analysis: multiple HIP participation modestly...
  – enhanced GPA at exit
  – reduced time to degree among students who entered first-time, first-year
  – increased likelihood that student graduated in timely fashion
Impact of Participation in HIPs on % of Senior NSSE Respondents Graduating on Time by Racial & Ethnic Background

HIP participation benefits Latina/o students more; Latina/o respondents Graduating “on time” Increases as HIP Participation increases, Rising from 38% to 73%
During the current school year, how often have you

- Combined ideas from different courses when completing assignments
- Connected your learning to societal problems or issues
- Included diverse perspectives (political, religious, racial/ethnic, gender, etc.) in course discussions or assignments
- Examined the strengths and weaknesses of your own views on a topic or issue
- Tried to better understand someone else’s views by imagining how an issue looks from his or her perspective
- Learned something that changed the way you understand an issue or concept
- Connected ideas from your courses to your prior experiences and knowledge
Oneway ANOVA revealed statistically significant differences, but effects were small (Cohen’s $f = 0.208$).
Multiple HIPs Boost Gains for Underrepresented Students

Within-Group Comparisons by Racial or Ethnic Category: Average Boost in Deep Approaches to Learning and Self-Reported Gains in Learning with Multiple High-Impact Practices (HIPs) vs. No Participation

Finley & McNair, 2013
Lesson 2: High Impact Practices

• All associated with desirable learning and personal development outcomes

• Multiple HIPs Make a Difference
HIPs are great.
Yet, Not all students partake...
Across all institutions...
• 52% Internships
• 47% Capstones
• 25% Learning Communities
HIP Participation: Differences by Race-Ethnicity

• 52% Internships overall
• Yet only 42% of African American students did an Internship

Source: “Assessment of High-Impact Practices: Using Findings to Drive Change in the Compass Project,” by A. Finley, Spring 2011, Peer Review.
More Difference... HIPs & First Generation Status

Data source: NSSE 2016
What do First Year Students Expect?  
(NSSE 2016 results)

- 76% expect to do an Internship
- 56% plan to do a capstone
- 35% expect to do research with faculty

What informs student expectations?
## Participation in HIPS Varies by Major

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major</th>
<th>First-Year Students</th>
<th>Seniors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Learning Community</td>
<td>Service-Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts &amp; humanities</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biological sciences, agriculture, natural resources</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical sciences, math, computer science</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social sciences</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communications, media, public relations</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health professions</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social service professions</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undecided/undeclared</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Overall</strong></td>
<td>15</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Overall HIP Participation: Race/Ethnicity

Senior year

- No HIPs:
  - White: 14%
  - Black or African American: 17%
  - Hispanic or Latino: 16%
  - Asian: 14%

- One HIP:
  - White: 23%
  - Black or African American: 29%
  - Hispanic or Latino: 29%
  - Asian: 27%

- Two or more HIPs:
  - White: 63%
  - Black or African American: 55%
  - Hispanic or Latino: 55%
  - Asian: 59%

Data source: NSSE 2016
Lesson 3: High Impact Practices

• All associated with desirable learning and personal development outcomes.

• Multiple HIPs Make a Difference

• Participation varies, not all students take part.
To Consider for HIPs:

What can you do in your HIP to:

• Enhance time on purposeful tasks?
• Add meaningful interaction between faculty, students & among students?
• Increase interaction with diverse individuals & approaches (challenge students ways of thinking)?
• Increase frequency of feedback?
• Add a real world, application experience?
• Increase students’ reflections on their learning and who they are becoming?
# IUPUI Taxonomy for Service Learning Courses – Course Design Centric for Institutional Assessment and Research

Thomas W. Hahn, Julie A. Hatcher, Mary F. Price, and Morgan L. Studer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SL Course Attributes</th>
<th>Level 1</th>
<th>Level 2</th>
<th>Level 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Reciprocal partnerships and processes shape the community activities and course design.</td>
<td>The instructor contacts a community organization to host students and provides a brief overview of the course (e.g., learning outcomes, syllabus) and the purposes of the community activities.</td>
<td>The instructor meets with the community partner(s) to discuss the course (e.g., preparation/orientation of students, learning outcomes, syllabus), and to identify how the community activities can enrich student learning and benefit the organization.</td>
<td>The instructor collaborates with and learns from the community partner(s) as co-creator in various aspects of course planning and design (e.g., learning outcomes, readings, preparation/orientation of students, reflection, assessment) and together they identify how the community activities can enrich student learning and add to the capacity of the organization.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Community activities enhance academic content, course design, and assignments.</td>
<td>The instructor includes community activities as an added component of the course but it is not integrated with academic content or assignments. The syllabus does not address the purposes of the community activities.</td>
<td>The instructor utilizes the community activities as a “text” to provide additional insight into student understanding of academic content and ability to complete assignments. The syllabus describes the relationship of the community activities to learning outcomes.</td>
<td>The instructor integrates the community activities and relevant social issue(s) as critical dimensions for student understanding of academic content and ability to complete assignments. The syllabus provides a strong rationale for the relationship of the community activities to learning outcomes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Civic competencies (i.e., knowledge, skills, disposition, behavior) are well integrated into student learning.</td>
<td>The instructor focuses on discipline-based content with little attention/priority given to civic learning or development of civic competencies.</td>
<td>The instructor focuses on discipline-based content and connects to civic learning and civic competencies when relevant to the community activities.</td>
<td>The instructor focuses on the integration of discipline-based content with civic learning and civic competencies and emphasizes the relevance of the community activities to the public purposes of the discipline in society.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Diversity of interactions and dialogue with others across difference occurs regularly in the course.</td>
<td>The instructor and the course and community activities offer students limited opportunities for interaction and dialogue with others across difference.</td>
<td>The instructor and the course and community activities engage students in periodic interactions and dialogue with peers across a range of experiences and diverse perspectives.</td>
<td>The instructor and community partner(s) engage students in frequent interactions and dialogue with peers and community members across a range of experiences and diverse perspectives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Critical reflection is well integrated into student learning.</td>
<td>The instructor asks students, on a limited basis, to create reflective products about the community activities, usually at the end of the semester.</td>
<td>The instructor structures reflection activities and products about the community activities that connect the experience to academic content, require moderate analysis, lead to new action, and provide ongoing feedback to the student throughout the semester.</td>
<td>The instructor builds student capacity to critically reflect and develop products that explore the relevance of the experience to academic content, use critical thinking to analyze social issues, recognize systems of power, lead to new action, and provide ongoing feedback to the student throughout the semester.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) Assessment is used for course improvement.</td>
<td>The instructor articulates student learning outcomes but no measurement tool is in place for assessing the service learning component of the course.</td>
<td>The instructor articulates student learning outcomes and uses a measurement tool to assess the service learning component of the course.</td>
<td>The instructor and community partner(s) articulate student learning outcomes, and use measurement tools to assess the service learning component of the course and its influence on community outcomes.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Its About Quality Teaching and Learning...

HIPs=EP^2

“EP”= engaging pedagogies
Lesson 4: High Impact Practices

• All associated with desirable learning and personal development outcomes
• Multiple HIPs Make a Difference
• Not all students take part
• Quality matters
To Keep In Mind: HIP Equity & Quality

• Equity concerns:
  • accessibility
  • negative experiences for students of color
  • effect on faculty

• Quality concerns:
  • curricular coherence
  • connections to co-curriculum
  • must be done well
  • little assessment of quality alignment with future of degree
Widely Available? Accessible?

63%
55%
55%
59%

Two or more HIPs

- White
- Black or African American
- Hispanic or Latino
- Asian
Critiques of Negative Impact for Students of Color?

**Critical Race Theory** (Patton, Harper & Harris, 2015):

- Are HIPs appealing to underrepresented students?
- HIPs may create opportunities for impactful, but negative experiences for students of color by exposing students to micro-aggressions & other racist behaviors in an intensive, academic experience (NSSE study found NO negative impact on sense of support & quality of interaction)
- Are there HIPs that bolster students of color belongingness that aren’t captured in current HIP definitions?
Educational Coherence: Stacked or Integrated HIPs?
Connecting HIPs in Co-Curriculum?

• HIPs demand student time & effort in and out of class

• Ensure all educators guide students to practices

• Collaborate to deliver effective HIPs
HIP Effect on Faculty?

**Faculty Agree HIPs are Important**

How important is it to faculty that undergraduates do HIPs (“very important + important”):

- Culminating Exp/Capstone 88%
- Internships 88%
- Community Service 64%
- Research with faculty 57%
- Learning community 49%
- Study Abroad 40%

» FSSE 2016 Upper Division Faculty results

- Implies other pedagogies are “low-impact”?
- HIPs on top of teaching load?
- Administrative curricular change?
- Expensive, siphon $ from research?
HIPs and The Future of the Degree?

Mix of academic disciplines interwoven with workplace experiences & hands on projects

Agile, and adaptive

Modular

Cohort-based projects
If HIPS are valuable...

✓ Promote equity of access
✓ Ensure quality experiences
✓ Assess effectiveness & impact
✓ Build into degrees, programs
✓ Acknowledge in faculty load/RTP
✓ Allocate facilities
✓ Document on student record
✓ Professional development & administrative support
Thank You

Be a HIPster. Design Engaging, High-Quality, Equitable HIPs!

Jillian Kinzie, PhD., NSSE Institute Center for Postsecondary Research,  jikinzie@indiana.edu